

Table 8: Assuming a roll of 300

This table assumes a Redcliffs "in-zone" roll of 300.

	Scenario 1*	Scenario 2	Scenario 3
Mt Pleasant School	\$3.3m	\$6.6m	\$5.9m
Redcliffs School	\$6.5m - \$8.5m	N/A	N/A
Sumner School	\$3.5m	\$8.2m	\$8.2m
Bamford School	\$2.7m	\$2.7m	\$3.8m
Total	\$16m - \$18m	\$17.5m	\$17.9m

So no material cost difference

Table 9: Assuming a roll of 400

This table assumes a 2029 roll of 400 students from the Redcliffs catchment.

	Scenario 1*	Scenario 2	Scenario 3
Mt Pleasant School	\$3.3m	\$7.6m	\$6.9
Redcliffs School	\$8.5m - \$10.5m	N/A	N/A
Sumner School	\$3.5m	\$8.2m	\$8.2m
Bamford School	\$2.7m	\$2.7m	\$3.8m
Total	\$18m - \$20m	\$18.5m	\$18.9m

75. What these estimates indicate is that there is potentially very little difference between these three scenarios in terms of property costs. ✓

Consultation about a Closure Proposal for Redcliffs School

76. Before making a decision about closing a school, the Minister of Education must consult with the Board of the school concerned and with the Boards of state schools whose rolls may be affected. Sections 154 and 157 of the Education Act 1989 require this consultation.
77. If your decision at this stage is that consideration should be given to the possible closure of Redcliffs School, you would need to initiate consultation with the Board of Redcliffs School about the closure proposal. The Ministry would also undertake consultation on your behalf with the boards of schools whose rolls may be affected by the closure of the school.

Timing Considerations

Return to Site

78. The Redcliffs School site cannot be occupied while houses on the cliff top behind the school are being demolished, due to the risk of falling debris. The Canterbury Earthquake Recovery Authority (CERA) advises that that these demolitions have not yet been scheduled due to third party complexities and insurance issues. Until these demolitions are scheduled, it is not possible to give a timeframe for the potential return of the school to this site.

79. CERA has also provisionally advised that once the work commences, it is expected that these complex demolitions will take more than six months to complete and that the demolitions cannot be carried out during the winter months. If you decide that the school should return to its site, it will continue to operate from the VADEC site until the Redcliffs site can be occupied.

OK

80. While further investigation of risks would be required, it is likely that construction of the protection bund could be carried out in parallel with the demolition process.

OK

81. Repairs to the existing buildings (and the provision of any new buildings required to meet capacity requirements) would enable an earlier return to the Redcliffs School site than a new build.

OK

Quite a delay though.

Closure

82. If you decide to initiate consultation about the proposed closure of Redcliffs School, and following the required consultation periods you make a final decision that the school will be closed, the Ministry would recommend that the closure take place as soon as practicably possible. This is because a lengthy delay between a decision that the school would close, and the implementation of that decision, could have detrimental effects on the operations of the school and its ability to provide high quality education. The school's roll may decline as families seek stability for their children at other schools, and experienced staff may leave the school prior to closure to secure job opportunities elsewhere.

✓

✓

83. However, timing of a possible closure would also need to account for the time required to undertake property work at Mt Pleasant and Sumner Schools, so that Redcliffs students could be enrolled at these schools following the closure. It is very unlikely that this property work could be completed in time for the beginning of the 2016 school year. In order for the property to be ready for Term 1, 2016, this work would need to commence by or before the beginning of May 2015 in the case of Mt Pleasant School, and by or before the beginning of June 2015 in the case of Sumner School. This would require a final decision about closure to be made by the beginning of May 2015, which would not provide sufficient time for the required consultation processes to take place.

✓

84. If you decide to consult the Board about the possible closure of Redcliffs School, the Ministry recommends that the proposed timing of the closure be either the beginning of 2017 (ie. the school's operations would cease at the end of 2016) or the beginning of Term 3, 2016.

85. There are potential benefits and drawbacks to each of these possible dates. Generally the Ministry recommends that changes such as school closures take place at the beginning of the school year, to minimise any potential disruption for children enrolled at the school. However, as noted above, there is the potential for a longer timeframe to also have detrimental effects for students, and it is possible that the unusual situation of Redcliffs School could exacerbate these effects. That is, as the children enrolled at Redcliffs School are already facing the disruption caused by the school operating on the VADEC site, families may be more likely to decide to transition their children to new schools earlier rather than waiting for closure.

✓

86. If, following consultation about closure, you decided that the school would close, your decision about the timing of this could take into consideration any feedback that had been received about this in the course of consultation. ✓
87. If, following consultation, you decided to progress closure of the school, the Ministry would provide support to the school (eg. guarantees around staffing) during the period between the decision and the closure. ✓

Risks

Risk of returning to site - Future disruption and uncertainty

88. If Redcliffs School returns to its former site, there is a risk that future cliff face collapse and rockfall events may cause it to be displaced again. The Ministry considers this a high level risk. This assessment is based on the following factors: ✓
- The findings received from MWH indicate that further rockfall due to ongoing cliff degradation is likely, but that the proposed mitigations reduce risk at the site to a level appropriate for a sensitive development such as a school. However, modelling cannot determine the extent or timing of future rockfall, or what assessments or further mitigations will be required. ✓
 - If the need for further relocation(s) arose in future, this would be disruptive for the school and community. It is possible that families may choose to send their children elsewhere rather than relocating again. ✓
 - The Board has reported to the Ministry that the school and community find it challenging to be off-site and to have uncertainty about the return to the former site. A return to site cannot provide the desired certainty about the school's future, because of the unpredictability of future rockfall and its consequences. |||

Risk of returning to site – Community not satisfied with site safety

89. If you agree that Redcliffs School should be returned to its former site, there is a risk that the wider Redcliffs community may not be fully satisfied that the site is safe, and families may choose to send their children elsewhere. The Ministry considers that this is a low level risk. This assessment is made based on the following factors:
- The Board shared the draft MWH findings about hazard mitigation with its parent community, and reports that the feedback received was positive about a return to site.
 - The mitigations reduce risk at the site to a lower level (10^{-6}) than the level that has been used as the basis for deciding whether or not residential properties in Port Hills are acceptable to occupy (10^{-4}). This means that the school site is at an even lower level of risk than many of the houses that are/will be occupied in the area. ✓
 - While some community members may choose to send their children to other schools, surveying families/whānau of current students and local families/whānau of pre-school age children will enable us to determine with reasonable accuracy the likely "market share" for the school. This will ensure that the level of investment in property is appropriate for its future roll. ✓

Closure – Community Disappointment

90. If Redcliffs School is closed, there is a high likelihood that the community will be disappointed with this outcome. The Ministry considers this a likely outcome because the Board's submission states a strong preference to return to the former school site and it reports that it has had positive feedback from the community about a return to site. ✓

Conclusion

91. A decision about the next steps for Redcliffs School requires careful consideration across a range of complex factors. Indeed
92. The expert advice provided in the geotechnical and hazard mitigation reports indicates that, with the recommended mitigation measures in place, the Redcliffs School site could be made satisfactorily safe for use as a school site. It must be noted, of course, that although the expert analysis and modelling indicates that risk at the site can be reduced to a satisfactory level, it is never possible to provide absolute guarantees of safety.
93. Spatially, the school site is well placed in terms of providing access to schooling for students from the Redcliffs area. A number of uncertainties around population projections and enrolment patterns make it difficult to determine what the level of demand for this provision will be in future, or the rate at which any increase in this demand may occur.
94. Current estimates suggest that the property costs associated with returning the school to its former site would probably not be significantly different to the costs of providing additional property at other schools.
95. At this stage, no timeframe can be given for when the school could return to its site, due to unscheduled demolitions which need to take place before this can happen. The school would continue to operate from the VADEC site until the demolitions are complete and the necessary property/mitigation works have been undertaken.
96. The expert advice predicts that there will be ongoing future cliff face collapse and rockfall at the site, but cannot predict the timing or extent of such rockfall. If a substantial rockfall event (in terms of either volume or size of boulders) occurs in future, it may be necessary to move the school offsite again while reassessments and any required mitigations are carried out.
97. These circumstances mean that a decision to return the school to its site would create a level of ongoing uncertainty for the school and its community. The Redcliffs School Board of Trustees has made it clear that returning the school to its site is the strong preference of its community, but has also emphasized the need for certainty about the school's future and the negative effects of the current absence of certainty. A decision to return the school to its site may not provide the desired certainty, and the Ministry views this as a factor that needs to be given careful weighting in your decision making.

Next Steps

98. If you decide that Redcliffs School should be returned to its site, planning will commence for this to take place. This would include the Ministry working with appropriate expert advisers to develop an operations and maintenance plan for monitoring the site and responding to future rockfall events.
99. If, based on the information provided, you are not satisfied that the school should return to this site, the Ministry recommends that you initiate consultation with the Board of Trustees of Redcliffs School about the possible closure of the school. A closure proposal is recommended in this instance as our investigations suggest that it is unlikely that a suitable alternative site would be found that is superior to the Redcliffs School site in terms of risk, and closure is considered to be a better option than merger in this case.
100. Once your preference is known, the Ministry will prepare a letter for your signature to the Board of Trustees of Redcliffs School advising of your decision. The Ministry recommends that a copy of this report be released to the Redcliffs School Board of Trustees. ✓✓